Annex 3 Supplementary Data

Table 3.1 Initial Stakeholder Analysis in relation to Community Development Activities, Magadi Division

STAKEHOLDER	DESIGNATED ROLE/ MANDATE	STRENGTHS	WEAKNESSES	INTERFACE WITH MSC	DEGREE OF IMPORTANCE TO MSC	
Maasai Communities, Magadi Division	- local inhabitants	sustainable livelihood/capital assets	limited capacity e.g. low literacy levels to leverage capital assets depletion of natural resources, main source of communities' livelihoods	Regular interaction but generally through an intermediary/via SWOT	High	
Magadi Group Ranches	- management of group resources so as to benefit the GR members	structures and processes/ framework in place to promote nature-based economic development	group ranch concept under- mined by poor accountability; cumbersome management structures; confused resource ownership and use rights; low skills and awareness; ineffective collaboration	Regular interaction via SWOT	High	
Magadi Soda Company	for-profit enterprise focused on extraction of soda and salt, with long-term lease on Lake Magadi/surrounding land	implementation of corporate social responsibility policy institutionalised stakeholder engagement arrangement (SWOT) local employment generation	non-sustainable approach to community development support			
Ministry of Education, Science & Technology	provision of enabling framework for development of education sector posting of teachers management of examinations	support of divisional education office (see Provincial Administration)	limited level of CG support (financial/human resources) to education sector in Magadi Division	Regular interaction via MSC's support to education sector	Medium - potentially higher	
Ministry of Health	 provision of enabling framework for development of health sector provision of health personnel provision of drugs to clinics and dispensaries 	provision of drugs to clinics and dispensaries provision of some health personnel to dispensaries provision of training initiatives e.g. HIV/AIDS	limited level of CG support (financial/human resources) to health sector in Magadi Division especially for rural clinics and dispensaries	Regular interaction via MSC's support to health sector	Medium - potentially higher	
Ministry of Agriculture/ Ministry of Livestock (& Fisheries Development)	provision of enabling framework for development of agriculture/livestock sector	- provision of staff at divisional level	detrimental effects of policy change on agricultural extension/veterinary services limited level of CG support (financial/human resources) to agriculture/livestock sector in Magadi Division	Limited interaction	Medium - potentially higher	
Ministry of Environment & Natural Resources & Wildlife/NEMA	 provision of enabling framework for development of environment/NR sector oversight of management of environment and natural resources 	- provision of staff at divisional level	Ilmited level of CG support (financial or human resources) to environment/NR sector in Magadi Division inadequate information dissemination on policies	Limited interaction	Medium - potentially higher	

STAKEHOLDER	DESIGNATED ROLE/MANDATE	STRENGTHS	WEAKNESSES	INTERFACE WITH MSC	DEGREE OF IMPORTANCE TO MSC
Ministry of Water Resources Management & Development	provision of enabling framework for water resources management and development	provision of staff at divisional level	limited level of CG support (financial or human resources) to water resources sector in Magadi Division	Limited interaction	Medium - potentially higher
Ministry of Tourism & Information	provision of enabling framework for development of tourism sector marketing of tourist destinations licensing of eco-tourism ventures		- limited presence in the Division	Limited interaction	Medium - potentially higher
Ministry of Lands & Settlements/ Registrar of Group Representatives (RGR)	provision of enabling framework for management and development of land resources e.g. Land (Group Representatives) Act provision of administrative function for group ranches	skilled manpower at HQ and in district offices	corruption/abuse of land allocation procedures unfilled mandate in support of group ranches e.g. RGR administrative function not adequately carried out	Limited interaction	
Ministry of Gender, Sports, Culture & Social Services, Dept. of Social Services	facilitation of social/ community development	- ability to mobilise communities	resource constraints limit engagement with communities	Limited interaction	Medium - potentially higher
Kenya Wildlife Service	conservation of wildlife and protection of inhabitants from wildlife through problem animal control and conservation education/advice on wildlife management and utilisation	partnerships with communities on managing conservation areas ranger output on Olkiramatian active participation in Shompole ecotourism project training of scouts/guides	severe human and financial resource constraints	Medium	Medium - potentially higher
KETRI	- research into Trypanosomiasis	potential contribution to improved livestock through local research into livestock diseases	limited application of research findings little community involvement in research	Limited interaction	Medium
Local MP	- representation of constituents		oriented towards urban/peri- urban parts of constituency	Limited interaction	Medium
Provincial Administration: District Officer, Magadi Chiefs (4 Locations) Assistant Chiefs (13 Sub- locations)	administration of central government affairs down to grassroots level including security and development planning representation of sectoral ministries at divisional level	administrative mandate capacity to mobilise communities	inaccessible DO offices limited provision of government services weak and hierarchical communication links between chief/assistant chief and communities no development budget	Regular interaction via DO/SWOT	High

STAKEHOLDER	DESIGNATED ROLE/ MANDATE	STRENGTHS	WEAKNESSES	INTERFACE WITH MSC	DEGREE OF IMPORTANCE TO MSC
Local Government: Olkejuado County Council/Ward Councillors Local Government Staff	representation of electorates' interests in local decision-making process provision of local services and infrastructure in accordance with vested powers and duties	some skilled manpower use of some Local Authorities Transfer Fund monies in accordance with Local Authority Service Delivery Action Plan on community development activities	weak communication links between councillors and communities rigid LA working practices/ structures which prevent adoption of new approaches to service delivery severe human and financial resource constraints	Regular interaction via SWOT	Potentially high
Community-Based Organisations: Women's Groups Youth Groups Men's Groups e.g. Women's Lobby, Lenkobei Community Integrated Project	informal individual groups concerned with improving standard of living/quality of life through various activities	generating alternative sources of income and development community mobilisation skills establishing participatory decision-making processes within community	small size of groups may limit longer-term viability operate independently without link to wider network low literacy levels	Limited interaction	Potentially higher
Non-Governmental Organisations (international and local) including SNV, ITDG-EA, AMREF, ACC, Rotary Doctors, HEART Team, Dupoto e Maa, and Entasopia Community Development Project	provision of services provision of technical information and research intermediary role between government agencies/MSC and communities information exchange and dissemination networking and advocacy	some have highly skilled technical manpower expertise in community mobilisation, participatory approaches, communication proven ability to work in partnership' some provide international exposure and linkages	lack of transparency in some organisations some lack of collaboration between groups leading to duplication/ overlap/confusion in targeted communities	Regular interaction via CDO/larger SWOT	High
International Partners (including financial, technical assistance, capacity building partners) including Danida, DFID, Dutch Government, World Food Programme, ICIPE, ILRI	financial assistance technical assistance information exchange	strong financial base strong technical capacity transparent and accountable global linkages wealth of experience	rigid bureaucratic procedures among some donors limited interest in collaboration/ partnership arrangements	Low level of interaction	Medium - potentially higher
International Finance Corporation	investment in private sector in accordance with environmental and social safeguard policies	negotiating powers with Magadi Soda Company commitment to preparation of targeted CDP via Corporate Citizenship Facility		Regular interaction	High

STAKEHOLDER	DESIGNATED ROLE/ MANDATE	STRENGTHS	WEAKNESSES	INTERFACE WITH MSC	DEGREE OF IMPORTANCE TO MSC
Art of Ventures	 private management/ownership of Shompole Ecotourism Lodge on contract basis for Maa O'leng Limited Company training of local people to manage lodge 	support to development of ecotourism providing local employment	insufficient exposure of local people/community to marketing of ecotourism sector	Limited interaction	Potentially higher
Maa O'leng Limited Company	ownership of Shompole Ecotourism Lodge, with management by Art of Ventures development of other natural resource-based enterprises	providing mechanism for community involvement in ecotourism and conservation	weak management and financial management capacity re: future responsibility for running lodge	Limited interaction	Potentially higher
Horticultural Companies	trading in horticultural produce for export	export income earnings provision of local employment	extractive, for-profit activity with no social responsibility to community/investment in soils no contribution to use of infrastructure developed by MSC	Limited	Potentially higher through supporting MSC's community development efforts

Source: CDP Consultancy Inception Report, May 2004.

Table 3.2 SWOT of the SWOT Stakeholder Groups

Group	Strengths	Weaknesses
Women's Group (Group 1)	 Honesty High concern for development and family welfare High sense of ownership of the CDP Empathy and understanding Commitment and voluntary service (able to mobilise resources) 	 High level of illiteracy Inadequate coherency and unity Inadequate knowledge on human rights Spend too much time in search of water hence little time to engage in development activities Own little or no resources Poor housing Lack of appropriate employment opportunities
Group Ranches (Group 2)	 Group Ranches are legally recognised entities Group Ranches are organised Human Resources (labour though unskilled) Ownership of natural resources Land Water Sand Wildlife Forest Stones 	High levels of illiteracy among members Inadequate technical skills Poor infrastructure (roads, telephone)
Administration and other GoK Ministries (Group 3)	 Coordination functions Budgetary and other resources when available Authority (able to mobilise) Skills and personnel (<i>Ujuzi</i>) Available at all levels (always) 	 Inadequate logistics (facilities, equipment, vehicles) Inadequate personnel Not current with development agenda / trends Negative attitude Low motivation among personnel Involvement in local politics Inadequate financial and budgetary constraints

Group	Strengths	Weaknesses
Local Government / Political Leaders - Councillor (Group 4)	 Capacity to mobilise community and donors Ability to co-finance using the LATF funds Ability to influence the use of constituency development funds (CDF) Ability to articulate the views and aspirations of the constituents (electorate / local communities) Availability of the educational bursary within the wards 	 Inadequate trust with other development partners (e.g. NGOs) Insubordination on leadership Lack of facilitation like transport Vast wards Destructive and negative politics
NGOs / CBOs (Group 5)	 Capacity for proposal writing Sourcing for funds Improved transparency and accountability Ability to network Ability to work with grassroots in order to address the local felt needs 	 Lack of coherent policy on collaboration and coordination for initiatives like the CDP Inadequate communication from and to the local communities Poor communication (bottom-up; top-bottom)
Private Sector (Magadi Soda Company) (Group 6)	 Available data concerning the community felt needs Good knowledge of the area having been in Magadi longer than most partners Available resources and commitment to Community Relations A good track record on community relations (COYA 2002, 2003 & 2004) Transparency (Best Financially Managed Company of the Year) Good partnership with Development Partners in the Division (NGOs, Private Sector, GoK, Olkejuado County Council) A developed structure to deliver CDP (e.g. Community Relations Office, the SWOT Group, Policy) Company is positive on community relations 	 Haphazard reaction to community requests Varying cultural backgrounds among company employees giving rise to stereotyping of local community members Inadequate sensitisation and appreciation by some company staff on good community relations Competition for resources among the various stakeholders (community, GoK (rates, taxes), Olkejuado County Council (cess, rates)

Group **Opportunities Threats** Women's Group Improved coordination among community, NGOs. CDP should address women concerns (Group 1) CBOs and others Rigidity in the CDP to exclude emerging women Improved distribution of resources to reach the needs and concerns needy and otherwise marginalised areas In the event that few donors are willing to fund within the CDP framework Easier and focussed fundraising Group Ranches Enhanced opportunity to develop tourist facilities Negative politics (Group 2) Free Education provides opportunity for more Povertv children to go to school leading to acquisition of Natural calamities (drought, diseases, floods) skills Administration and Staffing - continuous Politics negative other GoK Potential to attract more GoK funding Population influx (new plant) Ministries (Group Increased collaboration with other working Uncertainty (retrenchment policies) 3) partners Local Government Increased opportunities to acquire skills Politicians always side with majority despite / Political Leaders Enhances donor support positive or negative - Councillor Corruption among leaders and people appointed Ability to mobilise donor funding (Group 4) to officiate the projects (e.g. chairpersons) Coordination of NGO activities Rejection and abandoning of project because of political differences Allocating projects where not required much due to political favouritism NGOs / CBOs Avail a working and guiding plan document Lack of legal entity to coordinate the implementation of the CDP (Group 5) Easier resource mobilisation Organised plan to avoid duplication Lack of flexibility (rigidity) in the CDP and its Provide expertise to the Private Company to fulfil implementation its social responsibilities (co-funding) Some NGOs / CBOs might be excluded by strict CDP guidelines or areas of focus

Group	Opportunities	Threats
Private Sector (Magadi Soda Company) (Group 6)	 New fashion of NGOs / GoK / Private Sector Partnership International networking available for soliciting for funds Collecting funds from various players within the Company for development purposes (employees - local & international, film crews, researchers, contractors) Success of the Pure Ash may lead to wider community profile Use of transparent financial system to lobby for funds 	 Withdrawal by investors Community projects might not be self-sustaining Politics either locally or nationally Misunderstanding internally or externally on what Magadi Soda Company does Great expectations from the community some of which might not be fulfilled

Notes: Table 3.2 contains the results of a SWOT of six of the constituent stakeholder groups represented on the larger SWOT.

Table 3.3 SWOT of the SWOT and Other Coordinating Bodies

	Strengths	Weaknesses
SWOT Group	 Diverse community representation in one forum Conducting regular meetings to follow-up on action Decisions made are binding Avoids duplication Serving as a channel for communication between MSC and community Conflict resolutions Policy formulation: employment housing business, etc. Targeted approach to Magadi community Holistic approach to development Community has been able to influence private sector (MSC) 	 Lack of legal status* Delay in implementation of SWOT Poor attendance at SWOT meetings by some groups e.g. Group Ranches (reasons include: problems with communication and transport, monotony and fatigue, and impatience) Lack of down-flow of information/SWOT feedback to community
Other Coordinating Bodies Group	Sub-DCC: Legal entity Appropriate structure providing links with communities Enables "democratic" expression PSG: Proper coordination between all MIDPP implementing agencies Enables participatory planning Involves different stakeholders Transparency and accountability	Sub-DCC: Poor accessibility of venue of Sub-DCC Lacks information on government policies

Group	Opportunities **	Threats **
SWOT Group	 Ability to fund-raise/source funds Networking with other relevant stakeholders/bodies Capacity to coordinate development within the community Human resource mobilisation Strong credibility within the community Available data bank for further exploitation in respect of CDP implementation 	 Traditional way of life i.e. pastoralism Negative politics both internal and external Natural calamities e.g. droughts, floods, etc. Lack of adequate procedures to enhance transparency and accountability Misinformation/communication breakdown Lack of funding to implement projects/activities SWOT has no legal standing Waning/fading community involvement in the SWOT process
Other Coordinating Bodies Group	 Pure Ash Plant (contracts, works, etc.) Ability to use lobbying skills 	 High competition between different coordinating agencies Inequality between partners in terms of power, resources and money

Source: CDP Consultancy Output Report, 'Results of SWOT Session with Larger SWOT, Magadi, 28 July 2004', August 2004.

Notes:

Table 3.3 refers to a SWOT of the SWOT forum as an "institutional arrangement" and of other coordinating bodies which are concerned with community development in Magadi Division.

- * weakness could become a strength if links made between SWOT and other legal entities e.g. Sub-DDC, OCC/LASDAP.
- ** generally, concept of opportunities and threats not well understood; in many cases, the latter more often constituted weaknesses.

roparation of a community Botolopmont han magacine code Expansion 1 roject

Table 4.1 Priority Areas of Need, Magadi Division

	Score					
Priority Areas of Need	Men	Women	Youth	Total		
Education	10	10	10	30		
Health, Medical Facilities & Sanitation	8	10	9	27		
Water	9	8	9	26		
Livestock Diseases (costs of treatment)	5	3	5	13		
Lack of Market/Declining Group Income	4	6	2	12		
Roads/Transport/ Communication	5	2	5	12		
Poverty Eradication/ Income Generating Activities	4	3	3	10		
Natural Resource/Wildlife Conservation	2	2	1	5		
Slaughter House	2	1	1	4		
Credit Facilities	1	1	1	3		
HIV/AIDS, Other STDs	1	0	1	2		
Low Capacity	1	0	1	2		
Poor Housing	0	2	0	2		
Food Relief Services	0	1	0	1		

Source: CDP Consultancy Participatory Rural Appraisal, July 2004.

Table 4.2 Impact Assessment and Future Potential of Community Development Activities, Magadi Division

SECTOR/ PROJECT/ACTIVITY				ASSETS/ ACT			CONCLUSIONS AND COMMENTS ON FUTURE POTENTIAL
	Social	Political	Human	Physical	Financial	Natural	
COMMERCE							
MSC Contracts							Potential for expansion through exploring support from agencies such as SNV and APDF-IFC
MSC Business Stalls							Limited impact to date but potential for improvement as IGA opportunities, which will require training and capacity building amongst community applicants
MSC Repair of Posho Mills, Oloika and Olkiramatian							Good potential for replication in areas where high demand and provided that type of management problems experienced with Oloika are addressed
Micro-Enterprise Development, MIDPP							
Entasopia	++	0	+	+	+	0	Project needs further strengthening and
Kamakuru 1	++	+	++	++	++	+	has high replication and expansion
Kamakuru 2	+	0	+	+	+	+	potential
HEALTH							
Magadi Hospital							Impact high - local community comprises 60% of outpatients, 95% of inpatients. Continued support necessary but alternative longer-term solutions need to be explored
Entasopia Trachoma Project	++	+	++	++	+	++	High replication and expansion potential
AGRICULTURE & LIVESTOCK							
Nguruman Irrigation Scheme	++	+	++	+	++	++	Activity has potential for being successfully strengthened and expanded
Lenkobei Tsetse Community Project	+	+	0	0	+	+	Activity has high potential for improvement and expansion as affordable and environmentally-friendly approach

SECTOR/ PROJECT/ACTIVITY				ASSETS/			CONCLUSIONS AND COMMENTS ON FUTURE POTENTIAL
	Social	Political	Human	Physical	Financial	Natural	
AGRICULTURE & LIVESTOCK contd.							
Livestock Market Centre, Shompole	+	+	+	++	+	0	Activity has potential for being strengthened and replicated to other centres
Livestock Market Centre, Oldonyo- Onyokie	++	++	+	+	+	0	Activity needs to be improved but has good potential for replication though not "wholesale"
NATURAL RESOURCES/ ENVIRONMENT							
Shompole Eco-Lodge	+	+	+	+	++	++	Activity has potential for being replicated in other areas but with more emphasis on building capacity of community to ensure more sustainable input/participation
WATER							
Water Provision: Train and Storage Tanks	+	0	+	++	+	++	Activity has high potential for improvement and modification so that it becomes supplementary to other modes of water provision
Sampu Water Pipeline	+	0	+	+	+	+	Activity has high potential for improvement to address management problems, which are obscuring benefits of this cheap and effective way of delivering water over long distances and to many people.
Dam Construction, Oldonyo-Onyokie	-	0	++	+	0	+	Activity has not benefited community. Type of support highlights need for greater community involvement and increased collaboration/partnership with other stakeholders

SECTOR/ PROJECT/ACTIVITY				ASSETS/ ACT	CONCLUSIONS AND COMMENTS ON FUTURE POTENTIAL		
	Social	Political	Human	Physical	Financial	Natural	
WATER contd.							
Karamae Shallow Well, Improving Water Supply, MIDPP	+	0	+	+	0	0	Activity not replicable since groundwater in Magadi Division is mainly saline and of limited quantities. Points to need for other appropriate options to be explored e.g. rainwater harvesting with storage pans/dams
Olkeju Ngiro Water Pipeline, Improving Water Supply, MIDPP	+	0	+	+	+	+	Project is a gravity scheme and has potential for being expanded to Olosinyai and Koora areas
HOUSING							
Housing, MIDPP	++	+	+	+	+	+	Project has potential for replication and scaling up through provision of revolving funds and making construction materials readily available in Magadi township
EDUCATION							
Bursary Schemes							Potential for expansion of such support but through harmonisation with other bursary schemes including those sponsored by community groups, and by GOK
Ilparakau Primary School: Construction of classrooms	++	+	+	+	+	+	Support to schools, particularly re: girl child education, has potential for being expanded to ensure sustainable development
Kayiorr Nursery School, Oldorko, Improving Education, MIDPP	+	0	0	0	0	0	Activity has potential for being expanded in order that the provision of classes 2-4 at the very minimum be supported
Olkiramatian Primary Boarding School	++	+	+	+	+	+	Activity has potential for continued support

SECTOR/ PROJECT/ACTIVITY	CAPITAL ASSETS/ IMPACT						CONCLUSIONS AND COMMENTS ON FUTURE POTENTIAL
	Social	Political	Human	Physical	Financial	Natural	
EDUCATION contd.							
Magadi Secondary School	+	0	+	+	+	0	Potential for expansion with consideration being given to provision of another secondary schools for girls only (boarding), existing school being for boys only as face fewer social challenges than girls
INFRASTRUCTURE & TRANSPORT							
Komeya Rural Transport Services, Improving Access and Transport, MIDPP	++	++	++	++	++	+	Activity has high potential for being enhanced and replicated elsewhere in Magadi Division using Komeya community as trainers/role models

Source: CDP Consultancy Inception Report, May 2004.

very positive positive Legend: XX

Χ

no change 0

negative

very negative

Table 4.3 Community-derived Solutions by Capital Asset, Magadi Division

Proposed Solutions by Capital Asset, Magadi Di	VISIOII
HUMAN CAPITAL	NATURAL CAPITAL
 Provision of adult education Staffing schools with trained teachers by the government Re-training of current teaching and management staff Provision of bursaries for secondary education Strengthening management capacity of management committees Strengthen education and learning on alternative livelihoods. The above could be provided through local fund-raisings (harambees), support from the local authority, MSC and NGOs.	Livestock Training of community health workers on curative and preventive animal health Support drug supply system within community - e.g. establishment of drug stores managed by the community Secondment of veterinary officers Management of tse-tse fly menace Construction and expansion of cattle dips in liaison with Veterinary Department livestock health campaigns.
 Health Provision of health drugs, equipment and staff within the clinics and dispensaries Secondment of more doctors to Magadi division Build capacity of communities in preventive health care Build capacity of community health workers and health committees Counselling, education seminars and support on HIV/AIDS from HIV/AIDS-related NGOs. 	 Conservation Support community wildlife initiatives Strengthen community, public/private partnership in the management of wild life resources Resolve community wildlife conflicts - such as elephants and monkey menace in Nguruman Support rehabilitation of degraded environments Support alternative livelihoods such as bee keeping, eco-tourism and power generation for horticultural produce especially in Nguruman.
FINANCIAL CAPITAL	PHYSICAL CAPITAL
 Access to Markets Support and strengthen livestock-based enterprises e.g. rearing and selling of small stock by youth and women groups Support bee production and marketing Support acquisition of transport facilities such as bicycles (boda boda) Strengthen training in management and business skills Avail credit facilities and support groups to access them. 	 Water Resources Replacement of plastic pipes with steel ones Training the local community on pipeline maintenance Sinking of more bore holes and shallow wells Strengthening the capacity of committees in water management Recruitment of permanent staff to manage water facilities Construction of more tanks along the pipeline among other suggestions

	 Development durable water technologies Extension of pipelines.
	 Health Support establishment of decentralised health facilities within walking distance.
	 Education Construction of new primary schools and refurbishing others Construction of new secondary schools Expansion of schools to include boarding facilities especially for girls.
	 Roads/Transport/Communications Construction of a causeway/bypass over Oldonyo Nyokie swamp Grading and murraming of feeder roads Improve rural transport facilities, road maintenance and repair using labour-based methods (as under MIDPP/ITDG) Promote public transport.
SOCIAL CAPITAL	POLITICAL CAPITAL
 Support groups through micro enterprise initiatives Develop groups' capacity Provide credit facilities for groups Support men and youth groups in gender development. 	 Promote access to national leadership structures e.g. the MP and OCC Promote women's participation in wider political system in the Division, District and nationally.

Source: CDP Consultancy Participatory Rural Appraisal, July 2004.